

## Attachment 2

### CRITERIA for EVALUATING SCHOLARLY ACTIVITIES

The following listing is intended to present examples of various levels of accomplishment in the scholarship of discovery, integration, teaching, and application. Examples of professional service including clinical service and institutional citizenship are also provided. This listing is not exclusionary, but is intended to assist faculty, department chairs and the CAPT in matching candidates' accomplishments to the promotion criteria. Moreover, areas frequently overlap in practice, although they are presented as separate and distinct entities here. Criteria listed here are not arranged in a particular hierarchy. It is the responsibility of the faculty member to provide the department chair and the chair to provide the CAPT with an explanation as to the significance of the various activities and accomplishments.

#### 1. DISCOVERY & INTEGRATION

The scholarship of discovery is original, disciplined research which expands or challenges knowledge. It encompasses the pursuit of phenomena and observations that results in the generation of new knowledge.

The scholarship of integration encourages innovative thinking that combines and connects various disciplines through the process of creative synthesis or analysis that seeks to interpret, draw together, and bring new insight to bear on original research. It provides meaning to isolated facts, and illuminates data, by putting them in perspective and fitting them into larger intellectual patterns. It requires innovative thinking that integrates knowledge from various fields, bringing different perspectives to bear on central themes.

- Evidence of peer review and acceptance of new or integrated knowledge through the dissemination of the results. [Section 7.2 & 7.2.1]
- Demonstrated evidence of originality as an investigator. Demonstrates the ability to initiate and design the research protocol.
- Fostering the research of other groups and individuals in the department, and related disciplines.
- Experience in the development of research policy.
- Collaborator in design, conduct and publication of the research, including as a participant in a multi-center trial.
- Coordinates the research at a national level in a multi-center study.

- Authorship of papers in peer-reviewed journals that demonstrate the ability to generate and test hypotheses. An ongoing, peer-reviewed publication record.
- Authorship of articles that integrate knowledge in a field or that assesses overall value of discoveries in relationship to the areas of basic or applied research and/or current practice. These will include systemic reviews, meta-analysis, and evidence based medicine
- An established reputation beyond the parent institution as evidenced by external letters of reference, invitations to present at national or international meetings, visiting professorships, service on study sections, organizing national meetings, serving as a national consultant, or on editorial boards of journals, etc.
- High ratings of their research or creative work - as attested (where appropriate) by citations indices, by references in published literature that cite the applicant's work as definitive.
- Achievement through the dissemination and adoption of applied research activities in clinical care, public health, preventive medicine, and military medicine including but not limited to:
  1. evaluation of the efficacy of various treatment modalities.
  2. evaluation of clinical and system outcomes
  3. evaluation of health care quality
  4. evaluation of health care costs
  5. development, implementation, and evaluation of innovative community education programs
  6. development and dissemination of peer accepted clinical or practice guidelines.
- Development of patents for discoveries.
- Funding: The source(s) and level of competition for successfully acquired funding should be documented.
  1. Co-investigator on grants or recipient of a First' award
  2. A principal and sustained role in the management of a research program with external funding.
  3. A consistent level of peer-reviewed and/ or other funding for research over a sustained period of time.
  4. Consistent funding for peer reviewed health services research.

## **2. TEACHING**

The scholarship of teaching communicates understanding. It challenges, extends, and transforms, the knowledge of discovery into something students comprehend. As a scholarly enterprise the creativity of teaching includes the development of innovative pedagogical practices and course materials, and aims to encourage independent learning and critical thinking.

Teaching achievements are presented in the “Level” format to facilitate the faculty member in understanding what the responsibilities and requirements are and how they apply to each academic rank.

## **2.1 LEVEL ONE**

- The ability to provide the effective transfer of knowledge and/or skills to medical, graduate and postdoctoral students; postgraduate physician trainees, faculty, other members of the scientific and medical community and the general public
- The ability to show students how to think critically and purposefully, broaden the students areas of interests, and most importantly encourage and help develop the skills for self-learning.
- Active participation in teaching activities of the department including two or more of the following: presenting a series of lectures covering one or more topics; acting as primary instructor in a course, advising students, attending or precepting on inpatient or outpatient service, mentoring students and fellows, seminar or journal club organizer, small group or laboratory teacher
- Coverage of the specified curriculum content and of the standard teaching load in the department.
- Meritorious teaching evaluations from students and peers.

## **2.2 LEVEL TWO**

- Development or redevelopment of teaching materials for students, continuing education courses and/or other faculty training.
- Writing of clinical case material for teaching purposes.
- Successful supervision of post graduate students and willingness to supervise major honors or postgraduate research projects;
- Invitations to present Grand Rounds/seminars at primary and at other institutions;
- Invitations to present courses outside of primary department.
- Provides written documentation of novel techniques in teaching on the delivery of care.
- Assumes leadership role in teaching, e.g., course director, residency or fellowship director.
- Consistently receives outstanding teaching evaluations or teaching awards, recognition as an

outstanding role model for students.

- Develops innovative teaching methods such as educational software, videotapes, packaged courses or workshops.
- Provides continuing education at local and national meetings
- Develops new educational materials.
- Successfully runs regional continuing education courses
- Creates a new course or curriculum.

### **2.3 LEVEL THREE**

Peer reviewed research achievements in educational areas at this level of teaching will qualify as evidence for the Scholarship of discovery and/or integration for Clinician-Investigators, Clinician-Educators who are candidates for the rank of professor, and faculty in the tenure-eligible track whose main area of research is in education.

- Evidence of peer review and acceptance of new or integrated knowledge through the dissemination of the results. [Section 7.2 & 7.2.1]
- Publishes articles on health professional education with emphasis on hypothesis-driven research.
- Analysis or review publications on aspects of teaching or the results of research on teaching, in the applicant's disciplinary area that demonstrated a scholarly level of expertise in that literature.
- Develops educational material in media other than print (video, computer programs, Internet) that demonstrate expanded peer recognition through utilization by institutions, educators, and clinicians outside of the USUHS.
- Receives favorable peer reviews or significant adoptions of innovative published or circulated instructional material.
- A strong record of publications in health professional education including but not limited to methodology, outcome assessment, competency, and curriculum reform.
- Evidence of systematic experimentation on, or scholarly analysis and evaluation of, alternative and innovative teaching approaches or materials, such as the development of inclusive curricula.
- Peer reviewed grant funding.
- Provides educational leadership by writing syllabi, textbooks or assuming an institutional

level policy making administrative role.

- Consistent participation in national educational activities - e.g., Residency Review Committee, programs sponsored by professional organizations, re-certification, workshops and symposia.
- Invitations to be a visiting scholar at another institution.
- An established reputation beyond the institution as an innovative educator as evidenced by external letters of reference and invitations to lecture or demonstrate at national conferences on teaching, organizing national meetings, serving as a national consultant, or on editorial boards of journals or to serve on national or international committees on teaching or curriculum or evaluation.

### **3. APPLICATION**

Application is a scholarly engagement with society, building bridges between theory and practice by applying knowledge to practical problems. It includes the professional service including as appropriate the clinical activities directly related to a faculty member's special field of knowledge, in which theory and practice interact.

#### **3.1 PROFESSIONAL SERVICE**

**Describes activities that are based on professional expertise and usually denotes peer recognition. [Sections 7.2 & 7.2.1]**

- Selection as research, education, or clinical program director at the institutional level.
- Membership on major decision-making committees in professional or scientific organizations.
- Membership on major decision-making committees in DoD, HHS, or other governmental agencies.
- Service as an officer or committee chair major decision-making committees in professional or scientific organizations.
- Service to local, state, federal, and national organizations through education, consultation, or other roles.
- Invited presentations at national meetings; invited research seminars at USUHS, its affiliates, and other institutions.

- Service on editorial boards of professional or scientific journals.
- Selection as a reviewer for a research funding agency study section.
- Selection as a member professional society review section or institutional review board.
- Utilized as a national consultant in area of expertise
- Selection to responsible positions dealing with health care issues at the local, state, regional, national, international or federal levels.
- Assumption of a substantive leadership role at the regional level - i.e., chairing committees, or accepting positions as officer of local or statewide professional organizations.
- Assumption of a substantive leadership role at the national level - i.e., chairing national symposia and meetings, chairing committees or accepting positions as officer of national professional organizations.

### **3.2 CLINICAL ACTIVITY**

- Active and effective participation in clinical activities of the academic unit.
- Documentation of active involvement in CME activities, including attendance at local grand rounds, department conferences, and professional society meetings.
- Demonstration of mastery and independence of clinical skills - (e.g., introduction of new techniques, improved quality of care).
- Board certification. Successful completion of recertification examinations.
- Support from internal peers at the site of practice.
- Selection by peers to consistently lead or participate in “morning report” and other clinical practice outcome activities.
- Selection by peers as a clinical department or division chair.
- Documentation of “preferred provider/consultant” status within the local and/or regional community.
- Invitations to speak on clinical topics on campus, or participation on institutional clinical care committees
- Leadership or presentation role in clinical rounds and conferences.

- Creation and implementation of a clinical curriculum for a new residency or fellowship educational program,
- Development of new techniques, therapies, or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of the population of served.
- Creative, active participation in the evaluation of the effectiveness (quality, utilization, access, cost) of the care being provided. Development of a new “standard of care”.
- Documentation of innovative quality assurance programs.
- Demonstration of effective leadership at the site of clinical practice - i.e., director of a clinical service, head of a division, chair of a department, head of an interdisciplinary team that creates and manages a clinical pathway and outcomes evaluation.
- Recognition for excellence in clinical activity at the local, regional, and/or national level through letters of reference, awards, institutional evaluations, invitations to speak, or requests to write reviews.

#### **4. INSTITUTIONAL CITIZENSHIP**

Contributions to furthering the USUHS SOM mission and programs.

- Service on committees or task forces within the program, division, department, SOM, and/or university and/or its affiliated teaching and research institutions.
- Appointment to responsible positions within the USUHS such as chair of a committee.
- Service awards from an area of the University.
- Participation in the activities of the Faculty Senate
- Participation in policy development, supervision or advice and certain administrative responsibilities at departmental, faculty or institutional level
- Participation in search committees
- Participation in departmental, divisional, and institutional quality assurance programs.